

Comparative Source Analysis (CSA)

Paper #2

Fall 2014

Page Length:	4-5 pages, not including Works Cited page
Value:	15% of course grade
Due date:	Beginning of section during Week 6. After this time, late penalties will apply (see MMW Style Sheet). Even with late penalties, your CSE will not be accepted after section of Week 9, after which time it will be considered “not completed” and will result in a grade of F for the course. Any exception to this deadline must be approved with specific and legitimate documentation <i>in advance</i> by your TA.

Purpose

In the Critical Reading Assignment (CRA) you just completed, you were introduced to one scholar’s position on a given subject. In the second writing assignment, the Comparative Source Analysis (CSA), you will examine how two pieces of scholarly work relate to a common topic and to each other. This assignment provides you with another opportunity to practice critical reading, summarization and paraphrasing skills and to introduce the process of formulating a research question. This assignment will:

- give you exposure to two different scholarly approaches to a common topic.
- teach you to think about how scholarship overlaps and how it differs in the treatment of a given topic.
- teach you how to identify conceptual problems, articulate the significance of those problems and analyze how well an academic argument addresses them.
- give you some practice in designing a research question

Read assigned articles/essays

Your professor has assigned two scholarly works that you will read, compare and analyze. Here is how you will find your articles/essays:

- Professor Chang has assigned two articles (published in academic journals) on the subject of the Black Death. You will find the following articles on Professor Chang’s E-reserves site by accessing the UCSD Library website:
 - Dols, Michael W. “The Comparative Communal Responses to The Black Death in Muslim and Christian Societies.” *Viator* 5 (Jan. 1, 1974): 269-287. *ProQuest*. Web. 14 Oct. 2014.
 - Stearns, Justin. “New Directions in the Study of Religious Responses to the Black Death.” *History Compass* 7.5 (2009): 1363-1375. *Wiley Online Library*. Web. 14 Oct. 2014.
- Professor Keller-Lapp has assigned two sources on the topic of women in early Buddhism: an article (published in an academic journal) and an essay (published in an anthology). You will find the following sources on Professor Keller-Lapp’s Ted site under the Writing Assignment Tab → Assignment #2 Comparative Source Analysis:
 - Sharma, Arvind, “How and Why Did the Women in Ancient India Become Buddhist Nuns?” *Sociological Analysis* 38.3 (Autumn, 1977): 239-251. *JSTOR*. Web. 14 Oct. 2014.
 - Barnes, Nancy J. “The Nuns at the Stupa: Inscriptional Evidence for the Lives and Activities of Early Buddhist Nuns in India.” *Women’s Buddhism, Buddhism’s Women: Tradition, Revision, Renewal*. Ed. Ellison Banks Findly. Boston: Wisdom Publications, 2000. 17-36. Print.

Write a four-five page analytical essay

Write an essay that explains and analyzes how the assigned sources relate to a common topic and to each other. You may organize your essay any way you feel is best, but your essay should contain the following elements:

- 1) **Write an introduction.**
 - a) Identify each source. Who are the authors, and what kind of sources are these?
 - b) Identify the common topic and provide any background information about the topic that is necessary to situate the articles in their historical context and to help the reader understand the content of the articles.
- 2) **Summarize the argument** contained in each of the two sources (maximum 200 words for each source). What problem does each author address, what is the significance of that problem, and how does each author address it with an argument?
- 3) Following the summaries, **write an analysis** demonstrating what these sources teach you about the topic and how they speak to each other.
 - a) What are the areas of commonality regarding the topic? Consider the author's: approach, problem, method, sources, thesis, claims, evidence and/or conclusions. Provide specific examples from the source and include marked printouts/photocopies for all citations.
 - b) What are the areas of difference regarding this topic? Consider the author's: approach, problem, method, sources, thesis, claims, evidence and/or conclusions. Provide specific examples from the source and include marked printouts/photocopies for all citations.
- 4) **Advance a research question.** Restate the common problem that these two sources address and formulate a Level-3 research question to which these two sources provide different answers. What broader question do these sources address? How well do these sources address the question? What might you still need to know in order to answer this question? (Note: A Level-3 research question is an open-ended question to which an answer can be *proposed* based on scholarly research, but that cannot be answered definitively. See the "Levels of Arguability Worksheet" that is posted to the MMW Website under Reference Handouts).

Note: You may use quotations in this assignment, but use them judiciously and be sure to cite appropriately.

What to turn in:

- ___ Your four-to-five-page Comparative Source Analysis paper in MLA format
- ___ Labeled photocopies/printouts of title pages and all other pages from which you have cited material. On each page, you must mark the material cited by underlining or highlighting the text. You must also write the name of the author on the top of each page.
- ___ Works Cited Page in correct MLA format
- ___ Submit the same version of your Comparative Source Analysis paper (excluding Works Cited page) to Turnitin.com by midnight of the day it is due in section
- ___ Your graded Critical Reading Assignment
- ___ Print and submit the CSA grading rubric